

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE  
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME FOR SPECIALTY  
0302000 "NURSING" QUALIFICATION 0302043 "GENERAL PRACTICE  
NURSE"**

**Period of external evaluation commission visit to the college: 14.10-16.10.2020**

**1. Composition of the External Evaluation Commission**

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 15 dated 09/11/2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct external assessment procedures in the period from 09/14 to 10/16/2020 within the framework of the institutional and specialized accreditation of the Kostanay Higher Medical College PSE of the Health Department of the Akimat of Kostanay Region (hereinafter according to the text - College) (dates of the visit to the college: October 14 - 16, 2020) in the following composition:



**Chairman of the External Evaluation Commission**  
ESTEMESOVA KARLYGASH AMANGELDIEVNA,  
candidate of biol. sciences, associate professor,  
Dean of the School of Nursing  
NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"



**Foreign expert**  
OLENIKOVA TATIANA ANATOLIEVNA,  
Ph.D., Head of the Education Quality Management Department of  
Educational and Methodological Management, Associate Professor of the  
Department of the Economic Faculty "Kursk State Medical University"



**National academic expert**  
TOKBERGENOVA GULMIRA TELMANOVNA,  
Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Honorary Worker of Education of the  
Republic of Kazakhstan,  
Excellence in Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Director of the  
Higher Medical College "Interdent"



**National academic expert**

KUMAROVA ALTYNAI BALTABAYEVNA, Deputy Director for Educational and educational work  
State-owned public enterprise with the rights of economic management "Taldykorgan Higher Medical College"



**National academic expert**

AMANZHLOVA TATIANA KADYROVNA, Deputy Director for Practical Training, NUO "Kazakh-Russian Higher Medical College"



**National academic expert**

TESLINA GALINA NIKOLAEVNA,  
Cycle Commission Chairman  
teacher of special disciplines State-owned public enterprise with the rights of economic management "Higher Medical College" of the Akimat of Nur-Sultan



**Expert - representative of practical health care**

CHADOVA IRINA VLADIMIROVNA,  
chief midwife of the STATE-OWNED PUBLIC ENTERPRISE  
"Kostanay Regional Hospital" of the Health Department of the Akimat of the Kostanay region



**Expert - student representative**

RAHYMBEK MADINA GALIOLLAKYZY,  
4th year student by specialty preschool education and training  
MSOPE "Kostanay Pedagogical College" of the Education Department of Akimat of Kostanay region



### **ECAQA Observer**

**SARSENBAEVA SAULE SERGAZIEVNA,**

Doctor of Medical Sciences, MBA, Professor

General Director of NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care"

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA General Director No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of the specialty 0302000 "Nursing" Qualification 0302043 "General Practice Nurse" of the STATE-OWNED PUBLIC ENTERPRISE "Kostanay Higher Medical College" of the Health Department of the Akimat of the Kostanay Region for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational programs in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education (hereinafter - Accreditation Standards) of the ECAQA , recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the educational program of the college.

## **2. General part of the final report of the EEC**

### **2.1 Representation of the PSE "Kostanay Higher Medical College" of the Health Department of the Akimat of Kostanay Region**

The educational activities of the college in the specialty 0302000 "Nursing" qualification 0302043 "General practice nurse" has been conducting since 1958 and is carried out on the basis of a state license issued by the Department for Control in Education of the Kostanay region of the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. KZ90LAA00012840 dated 12.09.2018. The form of study is daytime, the normative period of study is 2 years 10 months on the basis of general secondary education and 3 years 10 months on the basis of basic education. The language of instruction is Kazakh, Russian.

Over the past five years of the implementation of the educational programme, 433 people have been trained.

The total contingent of the EP "Nursing" was 570 students. 50 teachers participate in training in this specialty, including 31 people with more than 10 years of experience, 5 people with 2 categories, 4 with 1 category, 23 with the highest category, with SD - 7 academic bachelor's degree, 1 master, PhD - 1 person. The honorary title "Excellence in Health Care" has 3 teachers.

### **2.2 Information on previous accreditation**

Specialized accreditation of the educational programme 0302000 "Nursing" Certificate for 5 years, (Registration number AB0661 from 30.10.2015 IAAR) Post-accreditation monitoring - October 2019.

## **3. Description of EEC**

External expert work on the evaluation of the educational programme 0302000 "Nursing" qualification 0302043 "General practice nurse" of the "Kostanay Higher Medical College" (hereinafter referred to as the college) was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of ECAQA (approved by the order of the General Director of the NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare "No. 15 of September 11, 2020) and according to the program and schedule approved

on September 25, 2020 by the ECAQA Director General Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the director of the candidate of medical sciences Ospanova A.K. An external expert commission for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards began on September 14, 2020, which included expert commission of self-assessment reports, preliminary examination of documents, and examination of the college website.

To obtain objective information, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with students, observation, study of the website, interviews of employees of various structural units, teachers, online questioning of teachers and students in the period 6-12.10. 2020, a review of resources in the context of the implementation of the standards of institutional and specialized accreditation, the study of college documents and teaching materials for 8 accredited educational programs.

On the part of the college staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interviews, interviews and demonstration of practical exercises in accordance with the requirements of the regional sanitary doctor in a pandemic was ensured.

The experts individually filled out quality profiles and external assessment criteria (institutional and for each educational program) for the appropriate complying with ECAQA accreditation standards. Recommendations for improvement were discussed, draft reports were prepared (9) and recommendations for improving implementation for each educational program separately. The Chair conducted a final open vote on college recommendations and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. Then the chairman of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment in the framework of institutional accreditation and accreditation of educational programs of the college.

#### **4. Results of the survey**

The ECAQA observer conducted an online survey of college students on the resource <https://webanketa.com/> from 6-12.10.2020. In total, the proposed questionnaire contains 22 questions, including an assessment of satisfaction with training and resources of the organization. The total number of students to whom the questionnaire was sent is 1179. The total number of respondents is 604.

By specialties: "General Medicine" qualification "Paramedic" - 72%, "Medical Care" qualification "Midwife" - 4%, "Hygiene and Epidemiology" - 0.16%, "**Nursing**" - **11%**, "Laboratory diagnostics" - 3%, "Dentistry" - 7%, "Orthopedic Dentistry" - 0.33%, "Pharmacy" - 1%, "Medical Optics" - 0.33%.

**Conclusion:** The dominant percentage of the respondents were students of programs in the "Nursing" (General practice nurse) (76%). The external expert commission of ECAQA determined that the college has a corporate culture and ethical behavior between all participants in the educational process, as well as a developed system of mentoring and consulting students on academic and personal issues. This leads to a positive attitude of students to the place of study. At that time, students are not fully involved in the work of advisory bodies on the development of the mission, discussion of the educational program and the educational process. Low involvement of students in research work was noted. Not all teachers provide feedback on the results of the lesson, and teaching methods need to be improved.

**An online survey of 78 teachers was conducted on October 6-12, 2020, the number of respondents was 58 (according to the staffing table - 78).**

Pedagogical experience up to 5 years - 48.24%, from 5 to 10 years - 12.06%, over 10 years - 40%.

**Findings:** the team has a corporate spirit and support from the management. The teachers are satisfied with the working conditions and the organization of the educational process, at the same time, it is necessary to complete special disciplines with qualified teachers, to strengthen the issues of advanced training in subjects and in the QMS.

**5. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational programme 0302000 "Nursing" qualification 0302043 "General practice nurse" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.**

**Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

The expert commission received convincing data that the college has a formulated Mission and Vision: to become a leading educational organization in the preparation of competitive specialists for the progressive development of practical healthcare, which are posted on the website [www.komeco.kz](http://www.komeco.kz). The Strategic Plan for 2018 - 2023 has been developed.

Expected learning outcomes were established, taking into account the role of graduates in the health sector and their social responsibility to society and the state.

Employment of graduates in 2020 amounted to 82.4%.

Consumer satisfaction with the quality of training specialists by the college was 91.4%. The college periodically reviews the mission, goals and expected outcomes. Representatives of social partners, teachers took part in the work on revising the mission.

**Strengths:**

- the status of the Higher Medical College;
- implementation of the mission of the educational programme, developed in accordance with the priority areas of college development;
- compliance of the college's strategic goal with the needs of the health care system of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- the expected end results of training correspond to the requirements of the State Educational Standard for medical and pharmaceutical specialties of TVE;
- the college pays great attention to the formation of social and ethical competencies of students, contributing to the observance of the principles of professional ethics.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 9 standards conform: fully - 8, significantly - 1, partially -, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1:** completed

**Improvement recommendation:**

1. Ensure the participation of stakeholders in the development of the mission and development strategy of the educational programme.

**Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that, in general, the fulfilment of the requirements of this standard is determined by the existence of a developed EP based on the State General Education Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which uses the Recommendations of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and the International Labour Organization. The EP is periodically analysed and revised by the methodological council, QMC, discussed at meetings of the Council of departments, pedagogical council, coordinated with representatives of practical health care in order to maximize the compliance of the programme content with the requirements of regulatory documents and the needs of all stakeholders.

**Strengths:**

- innovative teaching methods and technologies that stimulate, motivate students and ensure the formation of their responsibility for learning outcomes;
- control and assessment of the conformity of the educational environment and the conditions for passing industrial practice;
- educational components aimed at instilling national values, the formation of patriotism, citizenship, commitment to a healthy lifestyle;

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 19 standards correspond: completely - 15, significantly - 4, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

*Standard 2: completed*

***Improvement recommendation:***

1. To improve the procedure for choosing elective disciplines by students.

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

Fulfilment of the requirements of this standard is determined by the presence of criteria and provisions developed and approved by the college, taking into account external regulatory documents that regulate the current control of students' knowledge, intermediate and final state certification.

Students are informed about the assessment criteria at the intermediate certification, at the stages of the FSA by the heads of the department, teachers, curators, through information stands, the official website of the college. The college has a procedure for documenting the student's assessment, monitoring the degree of student satisfaction.

**Strengths:**

- the presence of standard scales and criteria for assessing the results of testing students, theoretical knowledge, performing practical manipulations, assessing knowledge in credit-module training, which ensure high objectivity of the assessment, regardless of the personal qualities of the teacher and student;
- the use of various methods and types of formative and summative assessment of the development of competencies by students (oral, written, programmed control), their rational combination;
- attracting workers of practical health care and other external examiners to participate in the final state certification;
- a high percentage of academic performance when passing the final state certification.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Out of 19 standards correspond: completely - 15, significantly - 4, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

***Improvement recommendation:***

1. To improve the procedure for assessing the reliability and validity of methods for assessing the knowledge and skills of students.

### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

Rules for admission to the Kostanay Higher Medical College, etc. The college pursues an academic policy of tolerance: openness, transparency and accessibility both at the admission stage and throughout the entire period of students' studies. Academic and social support for students is provided.

*Experts studied:* journal for accepting applications from applicants for 2019, Orders for the admission of applicants for the 2020-2021 academic year, Order for expulsion, Protocol of the pedagogical council for the 2019-2020 academic year, Orders for transferring to the budget for 2019, Plan of scientific -research work of students for the 2020-2021 academic year, the Code of honour of the teacher and the student, certificates of the Ministry of Education about employment for 2019, the Regulation on additional studies and work off.

**Strengths:**

- there is a practice of transferring students from other medical colleges;
- participation of the college in the pilot implementation of differentiated selection of applicants to medical colleges in the form of an interview with a comprehensive and independent assessment of the non-cognitive abilities of applicants;
- implementation of the project "School for a Young Family", which is aimed at promoting family values and traditions;
- college students are provided with comprehensive assistance and support in all areas of activity (self-government, volunteering, creativity, etc.);

- the college has created all conditions for the development of the scientific potential of students, the development of professional skills, experience of continuous professional development and creative abilities.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 13 standards correspond: fully - 13, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 4: completed**

**Improvement recommendation:**

1. To involve students of the accredited educational programme to participate in the advisory bodies and structural divisions of the college.

### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY**

The existence of a policy for the selection and admission and development of employees participating in the implementation of the educational programme, based on an analysis of the needs and mission of the educational programme. Conditions have been created for the work of highly qualified specialists: there is a sufficient material and technical base, information resources, opportunities for retraining and advanced training.

*Experts studied:* Strategic plan for 5 years, staffing for 2019-2020 academic year, personnel policy, individual plans of teachers, personal files of teachers, Job descriptions of teachers, Teacher rating for 2018-2019 academic year, teacher's portfolio (2), methodological developments of open classes, protocol of the methodological council, Order for tariffication for 2019, questionnaires for interviewing teachers.

**Strengths:**

- availability of qualified staff of teachers;
- rating system for assessing the competence of the teaching staff;
- the maximum permissible number of disciplines (4) that a teacher can lead has been determined, which helps to maintain the quality of the educational process;
- the functioning of the School of the Aspiring Teacher, the School of Excellence, and the practice of mentoring.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 4 standards correspond: completely - 4, significantly -3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

The availability of a material and technical base that allows for the implementation of an educational programme, which includes an auditorium fund, a library, a book fund, information resources, etc.

The equipment of classrooms for special disciplines meets the requirements and averages 98%. The material and technical base is being modernized systematically. The educational space of the college is connected with Internet access that can be used by students and teachers.

*Experts studied:* Strategic plan, Model Cooperation Agreement, Order on the passage of clinical practice (on the appointment of mentors) of 2019, Safety Journal, International Cooperation Agreement (5).

**Strengths:**

- constant replenishment of the park of modern simulation mannequins, computer and interactive equipment;
- the presence of an electronic library system;

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 13 standards conform: completely - 9, significantly - 4, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

**Standard 6: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Improve the potential of the scientific base of the college and determine the priority areas of scientific research in the context of the educational programme.

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

Evaluation of the educational programme "Nursing" is carried out by monitoring customer satisfaction through questionnaires, interviews, monitoring the quality of knowledge in dynamics. Questionnaires for students, teaching staff, employers have been developed.

Employers note satisfaction with the quality of the theoretical knowledge provided and the formed practical skills of graduates.

The results of the EP assessment are analysed, considered at meetings of the Methodological Council, the Pedagogical Council, decisions are made to improve the educational process.

*Experts studied:* Exam schedules for 2019, Exam sheets for 2018 and 2019, Order for FSA for 2019, summary sheets for 2018.2019, protocols of pedagogical and methodological councils for 2018, 2019, 2020, working educational programmes and educational-methodical complexes of disciplines, syllabuses, questionnaires "Satisfaction of employers with the quality of training of graduates" for 2019, "Satisfaction of students with training at KHMC" for 2019

### **Strengths:**

- regular internal and external assessment of the educational programme with the involvement of representatives of medical organizations for compliance with the requirements of the State Educational Standard of Education, regulatory legal acts and consumer requirements;
- conducting a questionnaire survey of students, teachers, employers on various aspects of the implementation of the educational programme, as well as assessing the degree of satisfaction with the educational process and the quality of training of graduates;
- conducting contests among teachers to assess the educational programme, for example, "For the best methodological development";
- high level of student satisfaction with the quality of the educational process, the conditions of college;
- effective interaction with social partners in the preparation of educational programmes, professional practice programmes, in the assessment of knowledge, abilities and skills of students;
- the use of an effective system for assessing the practical knowledge and skills of students during final certification (ASTOP, OSKE);

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 10 standards conforms: fully - 10, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

**Standard 7: completed**

### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

6. Involvement of social partners in the evaluation of the educational programme.

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

College management is based on the principles of QMS. To identify weaknesses, the management conducts a self-assessment procedure among the structural divisions of the college. The identified risks are taken into account by management when developing plans and making management decisions.

*Experts studied:* Strategic plan, self-assessment report, SWOT analysis, college organizational structure, Quality management system, (ISO 9001: 2015), teacher council protocol.

### **Strengths:**

- the college developed a structure for the management and administration of the main and auxiliary processes;
- The college engages in constructive engagement with the health sector, community and government to help provide skilled professionals in line with community needs.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 12 standards conform: fully - 10, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

**Standard 8: completed**

### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**



1. Introduce representatives of practical health care in Kostanay to the pedagogical council of the college;
2. Clearly define the responsibilities of academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational programme;

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The expert commission received convincing data that the fulfilment of the requirements of this standard is determined by the presence of an approved organizational structure and a college development strategy.

Strengths:

2. the development strategy of the college was developed, aimed at training competitive specialists focused on work in multidisciplinary medical organizations capable of operating in market conditions.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 4 standards correspond: completely - 3, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 9: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Improving the procedure for continuous improvement to update the educational programme based on the results of promising research in the field of medicine, assessing one's own experience, analysing modern literature on medical and pharmaceutical education, taking into account priority issues that ensure its continuous improvement.


Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfilment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analysing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external peer review programme were found.

### **6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme in the specialty "Nursing" qualification " General practice nurse ":**

1. Ensure stakeholder participation in the development of the college's mission and strategy.
2. To improve the procedure for choosing elective disciplines by students.
3. To improve the procedure for assessing the reliability and validity of methods for assessing the knowledge and skills of students.
4. To involve students of the accredited educational programme to participate in the advisory bodies and structural divisions of the college.
5. Improve potential scientific base of the college and determine the priority areas of research in the context of the educational programme.
6. Involve social partners in the evaluation of the educational programme.
7. Introduce representatives of practical health care in Kostanay to the pedagogical council of the college;
8. Clearly define the responsibilities of academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational programme;
9. Improving the procedure for continuous improvement to update the educational programme based on the results of promising research in the field of medicine, assessing one's own experience, analyzing modern literature on medical and pharmaceutical education, taking into account priority issues that ensure its continuous improvement.

### 7. Recommendation

**to the Accreditation Council ECAQA According to the results of expert evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty "Nursing" qualification " General practice nurse " of the Kostanay Higher medical College to the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes for the medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education, members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme for a period of 5 years.**

Chairman of the External Expert Commission The foreign expert National Academic Expert National Academic Expert National Academic Expert National Academic Expert Expert-health representative Expert representative of the students The observer ECAQA	Karlygash Amangeldievna Oleynikova Tatyana Anatolyevna Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna Kumarova Altynai Baltabaeva Amanzholova Tatyana Kadyrovna Teslina Galina Nikolaevna Chadova Irina Vladimirovna Rahymbek Madina Gorillaz Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergeievna	
---	--	---

Quality profile and external assessment criteria (generalization) of educational programs of specialty "Nursing" qualification " General practice nurse "for compliance with Accreditation Standards

standard	Criteria for evaluation	BS / SU	Total standards	Assessment			
				Totally coincides	Significantly meets the requirements	Partially meets	Does not meet
1	<b>MISSION AND END OUTCOMES</b>	9/0	9	8	1		
2	<b>EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES</b>	15/4	19	15	4		
3	<b>ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS</b>	2/3	5	4	1		
4	<b>STUDENTS</b>	8/5	13	13	0		
5	<b>ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY</b>	2/2	4	1	3		
6	<b>EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>	8/5	13	9	4		
7	<b>PROGRAMME EVALUATION</b>	6/4	10	10	0		
<b>8</b>	<b>GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION</b>	<b>6/6</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>2</b>		
<b>9</b>	<b>CONTINUOUS RENEWAL</b>	<b>1/3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>		
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>57/32</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>73</b>	<b>16</b>		

\* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and compliance must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.

**List of documents requested by EEC members**  
**List of documents requested by members of the EEC in the framework of the specialized accreditation of the educational programme in the specialty**

1. KHMC work plan for the 2019-2020 academic year
2. Work plan of teachers (for 2018, 2019)
3. Annual report for the 2019-2020 academic year
4. CI, Regulations on divisions
  - Practice Work Programs (2)
  - Agreements with clinical bases (52)
  - Score Sheets (10)
  - Sample Diaries (2)
  - Diaries (20)
  - SEC results in the specialty "Medical Care" (for 2018, 2019)
  - Employers survey (for 2018, 2019)
  - Medical office (documentation)
  - Regulations on the personnel reserve
  - Payment system regulations
  - The results of employment in the specialty "Medical Care" (for 2018, 2019)
  - Standard student expulsion rules
  - Regulations on working off missed classes
  - List of personnel reserve
  - Internal regulations on the remuneration system
  - Regulation on the tariffing commission
  - Student Discount Orders (2018,2019)
  - International cooperation plan
  - The number of teachers in the disciplines of accreditation programs
  - Distribution of teaching load in all specialties
  - Study guides published by college staff
  - Provision of literature in the disciplines of the specialty "Medical Care"
  - Educational work plan for 2019 and 2020
  - Plan of the NSC (scientific student circle) for 3 years
  - List of students of the programs of the specialty " Medical Care" participating in the research work for 3 years
  - Position on curators - based on job responsibilities